

science. Each section of the text is preceded by a brief synopsis, including an indication of the section's "most interesting and often-discussed passages," and nearly every passage is punctuated by an excerpt from commentarial literature as well as Van Norden's own insightful comments. This edition not only illuminates the *Mengzi's* milieu, but also that of Zhu Xi and the "Neo-Confucian" orthodoxy that Zhu helped to create in medieval China. Moreover, Van Norden demonstrates how, despite the fact that Zhu's interpretation (itself designated canonical in the fourteenth century CE) elevated the *Mengzi* to canonical status as one of the so-called "Four Books" of the Confucian curriculum, his "metaphysics derails his otherwise keen textual insight" by often reading this early pre-Buddhist text in terms of categories inherited from a millennium of Chinese contact with Buddhist thought. Those who seek to encounter "the most cogent, coherent, and comprehensible" of Confucian classics in an inexpensive, idiomatic, and accurate edition with an ample yet unobtrusive textual apparatus can do no better than to seek out this translation.

Jeffrey L. Richey
Berea College

Buddhism

TIBETAN TANTRIC MANUSCRIPTS FROM DUNHUANG: A DESCRIPTIVE CATALOGUE OF THE STEIN COLLECTION AT THE BRITISH LIBRARY. By Jacob Dalton and Sam van Schaik. Brill's Tibetan Studies Library, 12. Leiden, The Netherlands: Brill, 2006. Pp. xxxiv + 390; plates. \$219.00.

The study of early Tibetan history and religion was revolutionized in the early twentieth century by the sensational discoveries at Dunhuang. These materials provide an invaluable lens on this late first millennium Central Asian crossroads, including remarkable documents relating to the culture and history of the Tibetan empire. Previously, scholars unable to travel to Europe had to rely on a limited selection of published facsimiles; and all had to make do with partial (and imperfect) catalogs. In recent years, however, the International Dunhuang Project (<http://idp.bl.uk/>) has been making freely available on the Internet high-quality scans of Dunhuang manuscripts from collections around the world. Scholars of esoteric Buddhism may now more easily exploit those documents held by the British Library (and to a lesser extent the Bibliothèque Nationale) courtesy of Dalton and van Schaik's excellent catalog of the Tantric manuscripts held therein. They have done a thorough and admirable job, providing for each item a number within a comprehensive and systematic cataloging system (yet including references from older systems), a bibliographic description, titles, incipits and explicits, and canonical parallels. Two indices allow quick reference to titles, names and terms, as well as to parallel texts in the French collection. Of particular consequence is the invaluable progress made in

identifying whole volumes that have been scattered across the English and French collections. In all, this publication is a signal achievement and should occasion a major leap forward in the scholarly analysis of these remarkable resources for the study of esoteric Buddhism.

Christian K. Wedemeyer
University of Chicago

RELIGION, MEDICINE AND THE HUMAN EMBRYO IN TIBET. By Frances Garrett. Routledge Critical Studies in Buddhism. New York: Routledge, 2008. Pp. xvi + 208. \$150.00.

Garrett's intellectually ambitious and well-researched study of embryologies from eleventh to seventeenth century Tibet not only elucidates the popularity of embryology as a religious topic in Buddhist Tibet during that period, but also critically evaluates the categories of "medicine," "science," and "religion" as they apply to the Tibetan context. Reading them as narratives rather than "logico-scientific" accounts of actual fetuses, Garrett articulates, often in fascinating detail, how embryologies composed by religious scholars such as Longchenpa and Gampopa, or medical commentators such as Kyempa Tsewang, expressed diverse views about the nature of human existence, its social context, its physical and moral causes, and its potential for freedom. She emphasizes throughout that even in a medical context (and such disciplinary distinctions were drawn in pre-modern Tibet), "embryological knowing [was] religious knowing." The clarity and sharpness of Garrett's argument sometimes suffers from her capacious reach. She attempts to tackle more than her share of large theoretical issues, while also meticulously laying out in detail a highly technical literature that spans more than half a millennium. Nonetheless, her work makes a significant methodological and material contribution to the history of Asian medical systems, and to a growing body of work on the relationship between Buddhism and medicine in Asia.

Amy Paris Langenberg
Brown University

ORNAMENT OF STAINLESS LIGHT: AN EXPOSITION OF THE KĀLACAKRA TANTRA. By Khedrup Norsang Gyatso. Translated by Gavin Kilty. The Library of Tibetan Classics, Volume 14. Boston, MA: Wisdom Publications, 2004. Pp. xvi + 709. \$49.95.

Gyatso's late-fifteenth century Tibetan text is a standard medium-length explanation of the important Kālacakra tantra system of Buddhist mysticism. It eschews detailed exposition of the system's scientific subjects to focus on fundamentals of theory and practice. As such, it is an excellent introduction to the more advanced forms of Indian-Tibetan Vajrayāna Buddhism in general. Kilty's translation is accurate and faithful to the original. Being a translation rather than an interpretation, the book presupposes that the reader has a solid foundation in basic Buddhism and the Mahāyāna, and some acquaintance with the Vajrayāna. This

book is required reading for advanced students of Indian and Tibetan Buddhism; it belongs in any library seeking thorough coverage of the Buddhist tradition.

John Newman
New College of Florida

LIVING BUDDHIST STATUES IN EARLY MEDIEVAL AND MODERN JAPAN. By Sarah J. Horton. New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2007. Pp. 232 + ill. \$69.95.

Horton's thesis is that Japanese Buddhist statues are best understood not as art objects appreciated for their appearance, but as real presences. For Japanese worshippers, these "living images" are treated as individuals "with a history, personality, and certain propensities." Horton examines the spiritual lives of powerful statues of four major Buddhist divinities: Śakyamuni, Amida, Kannon, and the bodhisattva Jizō at famous temples like Kiyomizudera, Asakusadera, Zenkōji, and so on. In her broad survey, which relies on extensive documentary research as well as her own fieldwork, Horton proves that such a view of images is typical from early medieval Japan to the present day. Horton, however, occasionally overlooks relevant sources, such as Faure on medieval icon worship, Miyata Noboru on premodern cults to *hayarigami*, and my own work on Kannon living icons. In addition, despite references to works like Freedberg's *The Power of Images*, she offers very little theoretically to explain how the line between the statue and the divinity represented disappears in the Japanese devotional context. She concentrates instead on relating the rich tradition of tales about these miraculous statues, which she supplements with material from her own observation of temple rituals. Her anecdotal approach makes this book useful in the classroom, and also fills an important gap about how Buddhism is actually practiced in Japan.

Mark MacWilliams
St. Lawrence University

ESTABLISHING APPEARANCES AS DIVINE: RONGZOM CHÖZANG ON REASONING, MADHYAMAKA, AND PURITY. By Heidi I. Köppl. Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion, 2008. Pp. 160. \$29.95.

This excellent and pioneering book opens up an extremely important subject in the history of rNying ma Buddhism: the views of the famous eleventh century teacher Rongzom (Rong-zom Chos-kyi bzang-po). The book has five sections: an introduction to Rongzom's life and works, an introduction to mantra from a Nyingma perspective, Rongzom's views on Madhyamaka in relation to Mantra, his four principles of reasoning as means for establishing purity, and a conclusion. In addition, there is a translation and comparative edition of Rongzom's text, *Establishing Appearances as Divine* (gSang sngags rdo rje theg pa'i tshul las snang ba lhar bsgrub pa). This book, although comparatively small, is of major significance for our understanding of the early rNying ma. It opens up an understanding of Rongzom's fundamental

views on the tantric notion of intrinsic purity, and how this colored his approach to Madhyamaka and to the use of reasoning in Buddhism. Köppl has an extremely good command of Tibetan and a deeply nuanced understanding of the contemporary tradition. She fruitfully combines this with a lively critical appraisal of the differences between Rongzom as presented by the modern tradition of Mipham, and the voice of the actual author of this text. Since detailed historical work still remains to be done, one cannot claim certainty that this text is genuinely the unmodified work of Rongzom, although much of the contents make it seem likely that this might be the case.

Robert Mayer
Wolfson College, Oxford University

BUDDHIST RITUALS OF DEATH AND REBIRTH: CONTEMPORARY SRI LANKAN PRACTICE AND ITS ORIGINS. By Rita Langer. Routledge Critical Studies in Buddhism. New York: Routledge, 2007. Pp. xii + 243. \$160.00.

This fascinating but absurdly expensive book (189 pages of text) is divided into three chapters, each of which has three sections. The chapter titles are: Death and Dying, The Funeral, and Post-funeral Rites; the sections are entitled Contemporary Sri Lankan Practice, Commentary on the Practice, and Some Historical Roots. The first sections draw on six months' fieldwork done in 1998-1999 and on questionnaires distributed then; they are written mostly in short, dramatic sentences, presenting the sometimes anecdotal ethnography vividly. The second and third sections are written in a more distanced, interpretive style: the second sections explore various topics, drawing on Langer's own experience and on various textual and secondary sources. The third sections are by far the longest, and draw eclectically on Vedic and later Hindu texts, on Pali and Sanskrit Buddhist texts, and on secondary sources dealing with history and archaeology, all of which are taken to provide "hints" and "suggestions" as to the meaning and origin of contemporary practice. This approach provides a multi-directional, kaleidoscopic ensemble rather than a unified narrative or linear argument. Langer concludes with the statement that, whereas historical materials are usually taken to assist in understanding the modern world, the reverse might also be true: "[a]cquainting oneself with contemporary Buddhist culture and practice can only enhance one's understanding of the texts." That is surely true.

Steven Collins
University of Chicago

REBUILDING BUDDHISM: THE THERAVADA MOVEMENT IN TWENTIETH-CENTURY NEPAL. By Sarah LeVine and David N. Gellner. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2005. Pp ix + 377; photos, maps, charts. Cloth, \$49.00; paper, \$22.50.

LeVine and Gellner's book offers a new perspective on Buddhism in the Kathmandu Valley, providing a detailed

local history of change over the course of the twentieth century, and rich ethnographic material collected from both Nepali monastics and laity. The book is particularly successful in its attention to the gender nuances of renunciation; it draws attention both to the inequalities between monks and nuns, and to the gendered differences in the choice to renounce (or return to) householding. A second, highly intriguing element of the book—though not actively thematized—is its complex picture of international Buddhist exchanges: LeVine and Gellner reveal Nepali Buddhists traveling abroad for purposes ranging from pilgrimage to education to initiation, and negotiating a variety of linguistic barriers. The book has two significant weaknesses: its heavy reliance on the tired analogy of Buddhism to Christianity, and its apparent embrace of partisan Theravada rhetoric (i.e., that simple, scientific Theravada is superior to the decaying, ritualistic Buddhism of Kathmandu). Although both these tendencies have long pedigrees in Western scholarship, it is perplexing to find them in a book coauthored by Gellner, whose previous work has argued for a far more sensitive conception of Buddhism in Nepal. Given a more nuanced framework, this book could have done true justice to its fascinating data—as an account not of how Theravada revived Kathmandu, but of how and why some Nepalis have come to negatively evaluate local Mahayana Buddhism, and adopt in its place Theravada and the monastic lifestyle.

Anne Mocko

University of Chicago

NAGARJUNA'S REASON SIXTY (YUKTIŚAṢṬIKĀ) WITH CHANDRAKĪRTI'S COMMENTARY (YUKTIŚAṢṬIKĀVṚTTI). Translated by Joseph John Loizzo and the AIBS Translation Team. Edited by Robert A. F. Thurman, Thomas F. Yarnall, and Paul G. Hackett. Critical Editions by Joseph John Loizzo and Paul G. Hackett. Treasury of the Buddhist Sciences Series. New York: American Institute of Buddhist Studies, 2007. Pp. xxix + 434. \$49.00.

Loizzo and the AIBS (American Institute of Buddhist Studies) Translation Team's excellent English translation and meticulous edition of the Tibetan translations of Nāgārjuna's *Reason Sixty* with Chandrakīrti's commentary enhances our understanding of this important but relatively unknown work, rich in its philosophical and psychological insight. In a provocative introduction, Loizzo challenges previous Western scholarly interpretations and translations of these authors' works and argues for a cross-cultural comparison of Nāgārjuna and Chandrakīrti with Nietzsche, Wittgenstein, and their postmodern heirs. His close reading of the *Reason Sixty* and its commentary shows how these Indian philosophers use reason as a therapeutic tool to cut through the cognitive and affective resistances that impede the realization of compassion and nondualistic wisdom. The careful annotation takes into account the Indian background of the texts but also uses the writings of Geluk scholars, Gyalsap and Tsong Khapa, to help resolve interpretative problems. This book is a welcome contribution to the growing number of

translations of Indo-Tibetan texts of interest to both readers with a background in Buddhism and in Western philosophy.

Karen C. Lang

University of Virginia

LION OF SIDDHAS: THE LIFE AND TEACHINGS OF PADAMPA SANGYE. Translated by David Molk with Lama Tsering Wangdu Rinpoche. Ithaca, NY: Snow Lion Publications, 2008. Pp. ix + 336. Paper, \$18.95.

This work contains the English-language translations of two major texts associated with Padampa Sangye (d. ca. 1117 CE), an Indian spiritual adept well-known for his teachings in Tibet, especially of the Shije and Chöd traditions. *A Sun Ablaze with a Thousandfold Rays of Attainment* is a nineteenth-century biography of Padampa by C. Sengé. This narrative begins with Padampa's previous lives, recounts his unconventional teachings and activities as Padampa, and extends through the lives of his foremost male and female students—a temporal scope not uncommon in Tibetan accounts of spiritual adepts. *Mahamudra Teachings in Symbols* presents the nonverbal teachings and verbal aphorisms of Padampa as interpreted by his student Kunga, as well as records of dialogs between Padampa and his students on topics related to spiritual practice and quotidian behavior. Five appendices presenting traditional and modern instructions on practice related to Padampa's traditions complement these two translations. Absent of any historical or critical analysis, this publication relies on popular beliefs (it assumes, e.g., the direct transmission of the Chöd teachings from Padampa Sangye to Machig Labdrön) and it does not consider available scholarly literature on Padampa, Shijé, or Chöd. The work also lacks such conventional academic apparatus as an index, a bibliography, extensive footnotes and nonphonetic transliteration of foreign-language words. However, practitioners and scholars interested in the teachings associated with Padampa who do not have access to the original Tibetan-language sources will appreciate this volume making these texts available in English for the first time.

Michelle J. Sorensen

Columbia University

BUDDHISM AND TAOISM FACE TO FACE. By Christine Mollier. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008. Pp. xi + 241. \$55.00.

Mollier's important book is an account of the interactions between Buddhism and Taoism in medieval China, constructed as a set of five linked case studies. Although the roots of Taoism are very ancient, it only took on organized form in about the second century CE, at just the time Buddhism was taking root in China. Thus, the two traditions developed in parallel, sometimes in harmony and sometimes in conflict. Mollier's five studies explore 1) Buddhist borrowing of the Taoist concept of "heavenly kitchens;" 2) Buddhist and Taoist anti-sorcery techniques; 3) Buddhist appropriation of a Taoist scripture on extending the "life account;" 4) Buddhist and

Taoist versions of the cult of the Big Dipper; and 5) the rise of the Taoist figure of Jiuku tianzun, inspired by the popular bodhisattva Guanyin. Among her goals is to investigate the actual workings of popular religion in medieval China, as an antidote to the assumption that it was an undifferentiated muddle of heterodoxy and superstition. Her case studies demonstrate the complexity of the relationship between the two religions, the mutual nature of their influence (along with some of the conditions that shaped it in one direction or the other), and the variety of avenues through which interaction occurred. The book sets an important example for the critical study of popular religious ideas and practices.

Kate A. Lingley

University of Hawai'i at Mānoa

VIRTUOUS BODIES: THE PHYSICAL DIMENSIONS OF MORALITY IN BUDDHIST ETHICS. By Susanne Mrozik. New York: Oxford University Press, 2007. Pp. vii + 184. \$65.00.

Mrozik's thoughtful book makes a strong case for how considerations of Buddhist ethics have neglected the body in centering on mental states such as intentionality. Using Shantideva's *Śikṣāsamuccaya* (*The Compendium of Training*) as her focus of analysis, Mrozik argues that the formation of ethical persons (in this text, the cultivation of the virtues of a bodhisattva) is a process that involves both physical and moral development. Thus, "the effects of bodhisattva practices are as manifest in the features, postures, and movements of bodies as they are in the experience of particular cognitive and affective states." The scholars that Mrozik draws upon in framing her approach, such as Foucault and Grosz, are well chosen for the task at hand, and the book offers a nice balance of theoretical discourse and concrete examples drawn from Buddhist texts. Mrozik's book does more than provide a corrective to overly cognitive theories of Buddhist ethics. It also focuses on the more constructive endeavor of contributing to the work of contemporary scholars concerned with embodiment, gender, and human differences. While both the corrective and constructive dimensions of the book make important contributions to contemporary scholarship, I believe that the constructive side is particularly original and useful.

Liz Wilson

Miami University

ORDINARY MIND AS THE WAY: THE HONGZHOU SCHOOL AND THE GROWTH OF CHAN BUDDHISM. By Mario Poceski. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press, 2007. Pp. xii + 287. 65.00.

Poceski's monograph thoroughly reevaluates the perception that the Hongzhou School of Chan Buddhism during the Tang dynasty (618-907) was idiosyncratic and defiant toward conventional Mahāyāna Buddhist teachings in China. The book is divided into two parts. Part one (chapters 1-3) covers the life and context of the founder, Mazu Daoyi (709-788), who trained Chinese and Korean disciples in an

innovative community, significantly based in southern China. Part two (chapters 4-6) comprises a careful inventory of the significant teachings associated with Mazu (e.g., "Mind is Buddha"), considered from the alternative perspective that the teachings of the Hongzhou school dovetail with contemporary interpretations of Mahāyāna literature in China. Poceski's study is based upon a comparison between Tang sources and "[t]he selective approach to collective remembrance of the past" he sees in the bulk of Chan literature from the Song (960-1279) dynasty, which apparently presents the Hongzhou School from an uncompromising angle. Song sources are certainly the product of ingenious myth-making as well as historiography. But, without clearly presenting the Hongzhou School and its teachings in Song sources, it can be difficult for the reader to understand what makes the Hongzhou School distinctive in Chinese Buddhism. Despite this consistent hindrance, Poceski's research provides an updated analysis of how the Hongzhou School corresponds with Chinese Buddhist doctrines of the Tang period.

George A. Keyworth

Kyoto, Japan

HOW ZEN BECAME ZEN: THE DISPUTE OVER ENLIGHTENMENT AND THE FORMATION OF CHAN BUDDHISM IN SONG-DYNASTY CHINA. By Morten Schlütter. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2008. Pp. x + 289; \$48.00.

Morten Schlütter adds a detailed and careful study to the recent scholarship on the early history of the Chan School. He explains that the dispute between the Caodong (J. Sōtō) advocates of *mozhaō* ("silent illumination") Chan and the Linji (J. Rinzai) advocates of *kanhua* ("observing the key phrase") Chan during the Song (960-1279) period in China was not merely a difference in soteriology but also a factional dispute properly understood only against the political and social context. Because appointments of abbots of public monasteries were strongly influenced by literati government officials, the different Chan lineages competed for their patronage. The weakened Caodong lineage began a revival challenging the Yunmen and Linji lineages for literati support. Hongzhi Zhengjue (1091-1157) taught that just to sit in silent illumination was itself enlightenment—a meditation practice attractive to the lay literati. Well-known Linji master Dahui Zonggao (1089-1163) vigorously condemned "heretical silent illumination Chan" and expounded *kanhua* Chan where the practitioner focused intensely on the *huatou* or crucial phrase of a *gongan* (J. *kōan*), pushing the practitioner to a point beyond thinking so that the "great ball of doubt" finally shattered into great enlightenment. Originally a factional dispute, this contrast in meditation practices set the paradigm for Chan/Zen practice that still continues to this day.

Victor Hori

McGill University

BODY LANGUAGE: INDIC ŚARĪRA AND CHINESE SHÈLÌ IN THE MAHĀPARINIRVĀṆA-SŪTRA AND THE SADDHARMAPUNḌARĪKA. By Jonathan A. Silk. *Studia Philologica Buddhica Monograph Series XIX*. Tokyo: The International Institute for Buddhist Studies, 2006. Pp. 102. N.p.

The problem of what the Buddha meant to have been done with his bones, body, or relics, after his *nirvāṇa*, depending on what *śarīra* actually meant, has perplexed Buddhists across Asia for millennia because the answer speaks directly to his status before his demise. This question has also interested G. Schopen, the leading scholar of early Indian Buddhism in the west, for decades, and in this short monograph, Silk picks up in the early Chinese Buddhist sources where Schopen left off in Sanskrit, Pāli, and Tibetan. By meticulously looking into passages from different translations of the *Mahāparinirvāṇa* and *Lotus* sūtras in Chinese, and comparing them with Indic-language examples, Silk sheds light on several fundamental questions in the study of Chinese Buddhism. One of these pressing questions is whether the Chinese were aware of the nuances of vocabulary in Indian texts, and if they were, did they opt for Chinese antecedents to contextualize Indian terms or attempt to maintain the Indian meanings? In the case of the Buddha's *śarīra*, Chinese could have seen his corpse rather than his relics or bones. Silk stipulates that they saw relics, but leaves plenty of room for other interpretations, including the possibility that we are only beginning to understand the relationship between texts and practice in Buddhism. This book is definitely intended for a specialist audience with advanced knowledge of at least one of the canonical Buddhist languages. This should not deter the nonspecialist from picking up such an intriguing return to classical philology.

George A. Keyworth
Kyoto, Japan

TIBETAN BUDDHISTS IN THE MAKING OF MODERN CHINA. By Gray Tuttle. New York: Columbia University Press, 2005. Pp. xiii + 337. Cloth, \$75.00; paper, \$24.50.

Tuttle's book fills a major lacuna in the study of the interplay between Tibet and modern China. Tuttle's extensive and rigorous archival research in both Chinese and Tibetan sources sheds intriguing light on the nuanced role prominent Tibetans played in both Chinese politics and the religious practices of many Han Chinese citizens from the late Qing through the 1950s. The work is full of detail about the political and religious motivations of such figures as the Panchen Lama, Dorjé Chöpa, Taixu, the Thirteenth Dalai Lama, and Sherap Gyatso, among many others. Important in this study is the balance Tuttle brings to the overarching and sensitive issue of the contested political status of Tibet. Indeed, Tuttle aims his book (quite incisively) at both Chinese nationalists and Tibet sympathizers, both of whom would benefit from a careful study of its compelling pages. A critical historian, Tuttle is well acquainted with the Sino-Tibetan interface and has spent considerable time afoot learning precisely what is at stake, and for whom. Perhaps the most valuable aspect of this text, full of intriguing details, is its careful and honest treatment of the evidence. Tuttle, unlike countless other writers, does not attempt to fit data into preconceived conclusions; rather, he allows the data to inform his careful conclusions. The result is a technically excellent and important contribution to the history of the religious—and therefore political—relationship between Tibet and modern China.

Eric D. Mortensen
Guilford College