

## **Buddhist Philosophy**

# Buddhist Philosophy

A Comparative Approach

*Edited by Steven M. Emmanuel*

Virginia Wesleyan College  
VA, USA

**WILEY** Blackwell

This edition first published 2018  
© 2018 John Wiley & Sons, Inc.

We gratefully acknowledge the following for granting us permission to use their material in this book:

“From the Five Aggregates to Phenomenal Consciousness: Towards a Cross-Cultural Cognitive Science,” by Jake Davis and Evan Thompson, reprinted in expanded and revised form from *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy* ed. Steven Emmanuel, Copyright © 2013 John Wiley & Sons, Inc. Used with permission.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by law. Advice on how to obtain permission to reuse material from this title is available at [www.wiley.com/go/permissions](http://www.wiley.com/go/permissions).

The right of Steven M. Emmanuel to be identified as the author of the editorial material in this work has been asserted in accordance with law.

*Registered Office*

John Wiley & Sons, Inc., 111 River Street, Hoboken, NJ 07030, USA

*Editorial Office*

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA

For details of our global editorial offices, customer services, and more information about Wiley products visit us at [www.wiley.com](http://www.wiley.com).

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats and by print-on-demand. Some content that appears in standard print versions of this book may not be available in other formats.

*Limit of Liability/Disclaimer of Warranty*

While the publisher and editor have used their best efforts in preparing this book, they make no representations or warranties with respect to the accuracy or completeness of the contents of this book and specifically disclaim any implied warranties of merchantability or fitness for a particular purpose. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services and neither the publisher nor the author shall be liable for damages arising herefrom. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

*Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data*

Names: Emmanuel, Steven M., editor.

Title: Buddhist philosophy : a comparative approach / edited by Steven M. Emmanuel,  
Virginia Wesleyan College, VA, US.

Other titles: Buddhist philosophy (John Wiley & Sons)

Description: First edition. | Hoboken : Wiley, 2018. | Includes bibliographical  
references and index.

Identifiers: LCCN 2017017089 (print) | LCCN 2017017825 (ebook) |

ISBN 9781119068259 (pdf) | ISBN 9781119068402 (epub) |

ISBN 9781119068242 (cloth) | ISBN 9781119068419 (pbk.)

Subjects: LCSH: Buddhist philosophy.

Classification: LCC B162 (ebook) | LCC B162 .B848 2017 (print) | DDC 181/.043--dc23

LC record available at <https://lccn.loc.gov/2017017089>

Cover image: © Jonathan Fife/Gettyimages

Cover design: Wiley

Set in 10/12pt Warnock by SPi Global, Pondicherry, India

## Contents

Notes on Contributors *vii*

Acknowledgments *xi*

Abbreviations *xiii*

Editor's Introduction *1*

*Steven M. Emmanuel*

- 1 **Buddhist Philosophy as a Way of Life: The Spiritual Exercises of Tsongkhapa** *11*  
*Christopher W. Gowans*
- 2 **The Other Side of Realism: Panpsychism and Yogācāra** *29*  
*Douglas Duckworth*
- 3 **Emergentist Naturalism in Early Buddhism and Deweyan Pragmatism** *45*  
*John J. Holder*
- 4 **Metaphysical Dependence, East and West** *63*  
*Ricki Bliss and Graham Priest*
- 5 **Metaphysics and Metametaphysics with Buddhism: The Lay of the Land** *87*  
*Tom J.F. Tillemans*
- 6 **Are Reasons Causally Relevant for Action? Dharmakīrti and the Embodied Cognition Paradigm** *109*  
*Christian Coseru*
- 7 **Zen's Nonegocentric Perspectivism** *123*  
*Bret W. Davis*

- 8 Rhetoric of Uncertainty in Zen Buddhism and Western Literary Modernism** 145  
*Steven Heine*
- 9 From the Five Aggregates to Phenomenal Consciousness: Toward a Cross-Cultural Cognitive Science** 165  
*Jake H. Davis and Evan Thompson*
- 10 Embodying Change: Buddhism and Feminist Philosophy** 189  
*Erin A. McCarthy*
- 11 Buddhist Modernism and Kant on Enlightenment** 205  
*David Cumiskey*
- 12 Compassion and Rebirth: Some Ethical Implications** 221  
*John Powers*
- Further Reading** 239
- Index** 243

## Notes on Contributors

**Ricki Bliss** is Assistant Professor of Philosophy at Lehigh University. Her publications include “On Being Humean about the Emptiness of Causation,” in *The Moon Points Back*, edited by Yasuo Deguchi, Jay Garfield, Graham Priest, and Koji Tanaka (Oxford University Press, 2015); “Viciousness and Circles of Ground,” *Metaphilosophy* 45(2) (2014); and “Viciousness and the Structure of Reality,” *Philosophical Studies* 166(2) (2013).

**Christian Coseru** is Associate Professor in the Department of Philosophy at the College of Charleston. He is the author of *Perceiving Reality: Consciousness, Intentionality, and Cognition in Buddhist Philosophy* (Oxford University Press, 2012), in addition to a number of articles that explore topics in Buddhist metaphysics and epistemology, including “Buddhism, Comparative Neurophilosophy, and Human Flourishing,” *Zygon* 49(1); “Taking the Intentionality of Perception Seriously: Why Phenomenology is Inescapable,” *Philosophy East and West* 65(3); “Dignāga and Dharmakīrti on Perception and Self-Awareness,” in *The Buddhist World*, edited by John Powers (Routledge, 2013); and “Reason and Experience in Buddhist Epistemology,” in *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by Steven M. Emmanuel (Wiley-Blackwell, 2013).

**David Cummiskey** is Professor and Chair of Philosophy at Bates College. His research focuses on contemporary issues in moral philosophy, political theory, and intercultural philosophy. He is the author of *Kantian Consequentialism* (Oxford University Press, 1996). Recent articles include “Comparative Reflections on Buddhist Political Thought: Asoka, Shambhala and the General Will,” in *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by Steven M. Emmanuel (Wiley-Blackwell, 2013); “Competing Conceptions of the Self in Kantian and Buddhist Moral Theories,” in *Cultivating Personhood: Kant and Asian Philosophy* (Walter de Gruyter, 2010); and “Dignity, Contractualism, and Consequentialism,” *Utilitas* 20(4) (2008).

**Bret W. Davis** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Loyola University Maryland. Among his books are *Heidegger and the Will: On the Way to Gelassenheit* (Northwestern University Press, 2007); co-edited with Brian Schroeder and Jason M. Wirth, *Japanese and Continental Philosophy: Conversations with the Kyoto School* (Indiana University Press, 2011); and co-edited with Fujita Masakatsu, *Sekai no naka no Nihon no tetsugaku* (Japanese Philosophy in the World) (Showado, 2005). He has also published numerous articles in English and in Japanese on continental and comparative philosophy, on the Kyoto School, and on Zen.

**Jake H. Davis** is Visiting Assistant Professor of Religious Studies at Brown University. He trained in Buddhist theory and meditative practice under the meditation master Sayadaw U Pandita of Burma and served for a decade as an interpreter between Burmese and English for meditation retreats in Burma and abroad. He has authored and co-authored articles at the intersection of Buddhist philosophy, moral philosophy, and cognitive science, and is editor of the forthcoming volume, *'A Mirror is For Reflection': Understanding Buddhist Ethics* (Oxford University Press).

**Douglas Duckworth** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at Temple University. He is the author of *Mipam on Buddha-Nature: The Ground of the Nyingma Tradition* (SUNY Press, 2008) and *Jamgön Mipam: His Life and Teachings* (Shambhala, 2011). He also translated Bōtrül's *Distinguishing the Views and Philosophies: Illuminating Emptiness in a Twentieth-Century Tibetan Buddhist Classic* (SUNY Press, 2011).

**Christopher W. Gowans** is Professor of Philosophy at Fordham University. In addition to his numerous articles on topics in moral philosophy and Buddhist thought, he is the editor of *Moral Disagreements* (Routledge, 2000) and *Moral Dilemmas* (Oxford University Press, 1989), and author of *Buddhist Moral Philosophy: An Introduction* (Routledge, 2014) and *Philosophy of the Buddha* (Routledge, 2003).

**Steven Heine** is Professor of Religious Studies and History as well as Associate Director of the School of International and Public Affairs and Director of Asian Studies at Florida International University. His research specialty is the origins and development of Zen Buddhism, especially the life and teachings of Dōgen, founder of the Sōtō sect. He has published two dozen books, including *The Zen Poetry of Dōgen* (Tuttle, 1997) and, with Oxford University Press, *Opening a Mountain* (2002), *Did Dōgen Go to China?* (2006), *Zen Masters* (2010), and *Dōgen: Textual and Historical Studies* (2012).

**John J. Holder** is Associate Professor of Philosophy at St. Norbert College. He is the author of *Early Buddhist Discourses* (Hackett, 2006), a volume containing

English translations of Pāli discourses that are essential for the study of early Buddhist philosophy. He has also published articles on early Buddhist epistemology, ethics, and social theory, including “A Survey of Early Buddhist Epistemology,” in *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy*, edited by Steven M. Emmanuel (Wiley-Blackwell, 2013). His research focus is on comparative philosophy, specifically comparing early Buddhism and classical American pragmatism with the aim of developing a naturalistic theory of aesthetics and religious meaning.

**Erin A. McCarthy** is Professor of Philosophy at St. Lawrence University. Her research interests include Asian, feminist, continental, and comparative philosophy. She is the author of *Ethics Embodied: Rethinking Selfhood through Continental, Japanese and Feminist Philosophies* (Lexington, 2010).

**John Powers** is Research Professor at the Alfred Deakin Institute for Citizenship and Globalisation, Deakin University. A specialist in Tibetan Buddhism, he is the author of numerous articles and books, including *A Bull of a Man: Images of Masculinity, Sex and the Body in Indian Buddhism* (Harvard University Press, 2009), *A Concise Introduction to Tibetan Buddhism* (Snow Lion Publications, 2008), and *Introduction to Tibetan Buddhism* (Snow Lion Publications, 2007).

**Graham Priest** is Boyce Gibson Professor of Philosophy at the University of Melbourne, Distinguished Professor at the Graduate Center, City University of New York, and Arché Professorial Fellow at the University of St. Andrews. His books include *In Contradiction* (Nijhoff, 1987), *Beyond the Limits of Thought* (Clarendon Press, 2002), *Towards Non-Being* (Clarendon Press, 2005), *Doubt Truth to be a Liar* (Clarendon Press, 2006), and *Introduction to Non-Classical Logic* (Cambridge University Press, 2008).

**Evan Thompson** is Professor of Philosophy at the University of Toronto. He is the author of *Waking, Dreaming, Being: Self and Consciousness in Neuroscience, Meditation, and Philosophy* (Columbia University Press, 2014), and *Mind in Life: Biology, Phenomenology, and the Sciences of Mind* (Harvard University Press, 2007); co-author of *The Embodied Mind: Cognitive Science and Human Experience* (MIT Press, 1991); and co-editor of *Self, No Self? Perspectives from Analytical, Phenomenological, and Indian Traditions* (Oxford University Press, 2010).

**Tom J.F. Tillemans** is Emeritus Professor of Buddhist Studies at the University of Lausanne, Switzerland. He is the author of numerous books and articles on Buddhism and currently serves as editor in chief of the “84000” (see <http://84000.co>), a long-term project to translate Buddhist canonical literature.

## Acknowledgments

Thanks to Wiley-Blackwell for permission to reprint an expanded version of Jake H. Davis and Evan Thompson's "From the Five Aggregates to Phenomenal Consciousness: Towards a Cross-Cultural Cognitive Science," which first appeared in *A Companion to Buddhist Philosophy* (Wiley-Blackwell, 2013).

Thanks also to the editorial team at Wiley-Blackwell for skillfully guiding this volume through every phase of its production.

Finally, I would like to express my deep gratitude to the contributors for generously lending their scholarly expertise to this project.

## Abbreviations

### Bibliographical

- AN *Aṅguttara Nikāya: The Book of the Gradual Sayings*. Trans. F.L. Woodward and E.M. Hare. 5 vols. London: Pali Text Society, 1932–36; *The Numerical Discourses of the Buddha*. Trans. Bhikkhu Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom, 2012.
- DN *Dīgha Nikāya: Dialogues of the Buddha*. Trans. T.W. Rhys Davids and C.A.F. Rhys Davids. 3 vols. London: Pali Text Society, 1899–1921; *Long Discourses of the Buddha*. Trans. M. Walshe. Second rev. edn. Boston: Wisdom, 1996.
- MN *Majjhima Nikāya: The Collection of the Middle Length Sayings*. Trans. I.B. Horner. 3 vols. London: Pali Text Society, 1954–59; *The Middle Length Discourses of the Buddha*. Trans. Bhikku Nāṇamoli and Bhikku Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom, 1995.
- MN-a *Majjhima Nikāya Aṭṭhakathā (Papañcasūdanī)*. Commentary on MN.
- SN *Samyutta Nikāya: The Book of the Kindred Sayings*. Trans. C.A.F. Rhys Davids and F.L. Woodward. London: Pali Text Society, 1917–30; *The Connected Discourses of the Buddha*. Trans. Bhikkhu Bodhi. Boston: Wisdom, 2005.
- Sn *Sutta-nipāta: The Group of Discourses*. Trans. K.R. Norman. Second edn. London: Pali Text Society, 2001.

### General

- Ch. Chinese  
 Eng. English  
 Gk. Greek  
 Jp. Japanese  
 K. Korean  
 Skt. Sanskrit  
 Tb. Tibetan